

The Hansard minutes of the City of Winnipeg Council Meeting for July 18, 2012 are now posted on the City of Winnipeg website

Interesting to read exactly what your City Councillor said or voted for. There was lack of information about the finances of the golf courses. Some Councillors suggested cross country skiing be part of any plan.

There were two items related to the golf courses on the July 18 agenda.

1. Modified Managed Competition
2. Approving Winnipeg Golf Services Special Operating Agency Business Plan

I copied a few items from the Hansard minutes but the whole document can be viewed at

<http://www.winnipeg.ca/CLKDMIS/SelectDocumentType.asp?CommitteeType=C>

### 1. Modified Managed Competition

On July 11, 2012, the Executive Policy Committee concurred in the recommendation of the Alternate Service Delivery Committee, and submits the following to Council:

1. That the Winnipeg Public Service initiate negotiations through a Modified Managed Competition (MMC) process at this time for the operation of City-run golf courses (Kildonan, Windsor, Crescent Drive and Harbour View) in response to Expression of Interest (EOI) # 497-2011, and consistent with direction from the May 25, 2011 Council decision.

Voted against: Councillors Eadie, Gerbasi, Mayes, Orlikow, Pagtakhan and Smith

Voted for: His Worship Mayor Katz, Councillors Browaty, Fielding, Havixbeck, Sharma, Steen, Swandel, Vandal, Wyatt and Mr.

Speaker Nordman.

2. That the Winnipeg Public Service report back to the Alternate Service Delivery Committee with recommendations resulting from the MMC process, with the intention of providing sufficient time to transition to an alternative operating model.

Voted Against: Councillors Eadie, Gerbasi, Mayes, Orlikow, Pagtakhan and Smith

Voted for: His Worship Mayor Katz, Councillors Browaty, Fielding, Havixbeck, Sharma, Steen, Swandel, Vandal, Wyatt and Mr.

Speaker Nordman.

His Worship Mayor Katz, Councillors Browaty, Fielding, Havixbeck, Sharma, Steen, Swandel, Vandal, Wyatt and Mr.

Speaker Nordman. Councillors Eadie, Gerbasi, Mayes, Orlikow, Smith and Vandal

Voted for: His Worship Mayor Katz, Councillors Browaty, Fielding, Havixbeck, Pagtakhan, Sharma, Steen, Swandel, Wyatt and Mr.

Speaker Councillor Nordman

Page 25 Ross Eadie ... I'm hoping that any agreement, because I know that this probably has majority vote for, that any agreements that go ahead, make sure that the Windsor Park Nordic Centre is protected...

Page 25 **Councillor Smith:** Yes, Mr. Speaker. I am very pleased that there are no plans to sell Winnipeg's publicly owned golf courses but should we not have a business plan and we can scrutinize before making any major decisions regarding our golf courses? I mean, a proper business plan that outlines expenditures through maintenance et cetera and deal with each golf course, not the sham, the one that we have here and should we not have public consultation on the future for our golf courses? Are we afraid to hear from our citizens? These golf courses were once all profitable. Why are they not now? Is it because we have not re-invested in their upkeep? Is it now because we charge them taxes? This I do not understand. They are green spaces that we must preserve. We do not charge the library taxes. Why are we charging our golf courses realty taxes? And what's all this gobbly-goop about modified management, managed competition. What does it mean? Surely we should know that before accepting that unknown direction. I cannot support this, I don't think we as a council should be supporting it. You know, this is a...what is Modified Managed Competition? I want someone to explain that. I don't have a clear idea from reading what that is. What are you asking the unions to do? We should not support this clause.

Page 26 Councillor Vandal: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I...we're back to the great Winnipeg golf course debate which seems to be taking up awful a lot of our time around these chambers in the last several years and even prior to that we've reviewed this file several times over the last 10 years but I guess I just need some clarification. I feel in some respects that we're being processed to death here because last May, which is about 14 months ago we, this Council approved and I supported the golf services organizational review which had a few motions. The first motion which was to divest ourselves of City owned golf courses for commercial and residential development. We know that's taking up the most attention and that's being filed today but the second motion was that in the short term we conducted competitive bid process for the operation of City run golf courses. That was adopted 14 months ago to conduct the competitive bid process to operate the golf courses and I'm assuming from that process 14 months later that nothing's come of that so from that competitive bid process in the interim we've adopted a mixed management or whatever it's called a managed competition process several months ago, the report came from ASD which is fine. And this process is saying that we are going to initiate negotiations through a modified management competition process for the operation of four golf courses. So I need clarification from the Chair, how that process is different from the process we'd started 14 months ago where we endorsed a competitive bid process for our golf courses, how is the modified management competition process

different from that? I need assurance from the Chair that...I think we need to measure ourselves against the best. We need to look at best practices all over the, all over Canada and make sure that we are doing the good job with our public assets. So I want to make sure that...I'm not afraid of competition. It's a great thing, but I want to make sure that there's an opportunity for the public sector...for our own services for the unions to be involved in this mixed management process because I want to go to competition but I want to, not prejudice, I don't want someone's come back a few months later and says but you voted for this. We've already voted to contract this out. That's not what I'm voting on today. Councillor Eadie makes the great point. **The skiing association in Windsor Park is a tremendous asset and that has to be, that has to be protected going forward no matter which model we go forward on.**

**Councillor Mayes made some very good points on the... how do you measure this. I mean, it's clear. The line out there it's a good political line that we lose a million dollars a year but if you look at the numbers, we transfer between 6 and 700, 000 dollars from the golf courses to the City of Winnipeg including I think about \$75,000 for 311 and when I golf at Windsor Park, I don't even call 311. I call Windsor Park directly. So I'm not sure what the SOA is getting from the 311 services. On top of that we've depreciated all these golf courses \$300,000 which is a part of the one million dollar loss so it's a good line out there. The media love it, but it's not reality if you check out the consolidated statements.** So, to focus in on the vote today, I want to ask Councillor Fielding, recommendation 1, we initiate negotiations with the MMC, Mixed Management Competition for four courses? That's a process that the public sectors are going to be involved in that the unions are going to be involved in and it's not the fait accompli that we're contracting this work out because if it is I'm not voting for it. Number two, Winnipeg Public Service report back to ASD with the recommendations resulting from the MMC process with the intention of providing sufficient time to transition to an alternative operating model. The presumption there is that we're going to that model and I need clarification on that, in fact I may even ask that on 1 and 2 separately just to make it crystal clear. Number three, EOI is closed, that's easy to understand and number four, that the requirement for a deposit be waived for negotiations through a mixed modified management competition if, perhaps the Chair of the Committee

can clarify that, that 4th recommendation. Those are my comments, Mr. Speaker. It's...this is a file that takes a lot of energy, a lot of time, a lot of administrative time, a lot of community time. I see other people in the gallery today that were followed this from Day 1. I commend them for that. It was never our intention to go out and sell our green space for commercial development, certainly it was not my intention for it, but you've got to benchmark what the City does against you know, what other cities do and best practices and I think our citizens demand nothing less, so I'm going to stand down. I'm going to ask for Councillor Fielding to clarify.

Page 28 **Councillor Fielding:** ... I think we've made a tough business decision that's here. First of all, we've talked about the numbers that we're losing, .. some transfers and that sort of...311 all the processes, but whether you believe me or the numbers that are in there ..

The unions at that point have an opportunity to be part of that; have all the data and essentially counterbid on that to make the process work, so I think it's a fair process. This is the start of the journey, journey is a strange word but, the start of the process because number one, we need to get all that data back so there's some great questions that Councillor Vandal and Swandel and Gerbasi and Mayes answered in terms of you know, are they responsible for this or that. 311, that's all part of the process that's going to happen. What we're doing is we're passing a process to measure how effective we are. Once this goes ahead

## 2. Approving Winnipeg Golf Services Special Operating Agency Business Plan

### ***Item 4 on the agenda -Winnipeg Golf Services Special Operating Agency Business Plan***

Page 33 **Item 4 – Winnipeg Golf Services (WGS) Special Operating Agency – 2012 Business Plan (Selection Report)**

Page 33 **Councillor Mayes:**.. Councillor Fielding can make an Emerald City out of these grains of sand and come back with something that we can all support for the golf courses because in terms of how the numbers are, I would say working here, it is a bit unclear but hopefully negotiations will lead to some success and we'll be back to consider... ..I tend to agree with Councillor Swandel. We may have too many golf courses. That is a different discussion than do we have too much green space..

Page 33 **Councillor Eadie:** ...I don't know why some new ideas weren't presented in this business plan like maybe, maybe you could have a private sector put in the 19<sup>th</sup> hole (bar), pay a lease cost or whatever and make some money and which would be a very, generates a lot of income and I know that the Mayor can probably understand that there's a lot of money to be made in the 19th hole given his business experience so. ... I just wanted to note that there's no new ideas being presented....

Page 34 **Councillor Fielding:** ..I'll be pretty brief here but I think a lot of the questions were answered, Councillor Mayes had talked a little bit about I think cross country skiing. I believe that's Windsor Park that you're referring to so you know any process that goes forward I think having an important amenities like that, which makes sense so let's let that managed competition process go forward and even if there was a lease agreements that were signed obviously that's something that I think that's important to the City so that would have to be incorporated in that. I support having those amenities for sure that's there.